Wisdom and the Renewal of *Catholic Theology*

Wisdom and the Renewal of *Catholic Theology*

Essays in Honor of Matthew L. Lamb

EDITED BY
THOMAS P. HARMON
AND ROGER W. NUTT

WITH A FOREWORD BY
MICHAEL NOVAK

PICKWICK *Publications* • Eugene, Oregon

WISDOM AND THE RENEWAL OF CATHOLIC THEOLOGY
Essays in Honor of Matthew L. Lamb

Pickwick Publications
An Imprint of Wipf and Stock Publishers
199 W. 8th Ave., Suite 3
Eugene, OR 97401

www.wipfandstock.com

PAPERBACK ISBN: 978-1-4982-7841-6
HARDCOVER ISBN: 978-1-4982-7843-0
EBOOK ISBN: 978-1-4982-7842-3

Cataloguing-in-Publication data:

Names: Harmon, Thomas P. | Nutt, Roger W.

Title: Wisdom and the renewal of theology : Essays in honor of Matthew L. Lamb / edited by Thomas P. Harmon and Roger W. Nutt.

Description: Eugene, OR: Pickwick Publications, 2016 | Series: if applicable | Includes bibliographical references.

Identifiers: ISBN 978-1-4982-7841-6 (paperback) | 978-1-4982-7843-0 (hardcover) | ISBN 978-1-4982-7842-3 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: subject | subject | subject | subject

Classification: CALL NUMBER 2016 (print) | CALL NUMBER (ebook)

Manufactured in the U.S.A. August 4, 2016

6

Monica as Mystagogue

Time and Eternity at Ostia[1]

Gerald Boersma

But to apprehend
The point of intersection of the timeless
With time, is an occupation for the saint—
No occupation either, but something given
And taken, in a lifetime's death in love,
Ardour and selflessness and self-surrender.

T.S. Eliot, *The Dry Salvages*

"Mystagogue" is a term that, in the Christian faith, hearkens back to the patristic world. A μυσταγωγός is one responsible for "initiating into mysteries."[2] It was the role of the bishop to "hand over" the sacred mysteries to the catechumens as his final act in their preparation to receive

1. This essay is offered in grateful appreciation of Fr. Matthew Lamb's ministry as priest and scholar. I have been profoundly enriched (and in ways that perhaps I still do not fully realize) by Fr. Lamb's wisdom and guidance.

2. LSJ.

the fullness of the faith at Easter. He would initiate the neophytes into the mysteries in which they were to participate, namely Baptism and Eucharist. Well-known examples include the "Mystagogical Homilies" of Cyril of Jerusalem and Ambrose's *De mysteriis*. Related definitions of μυσταγωγός include "generally, *teacher, guide*" and also, more specifically a "*Christian priest*."[3]

The mystagogue serves especially a *priestly* role in that the mystagogue bears the mystery of God and initiates those entrusted to him into this mystery. As priest he *links* heaven and earth, offering humanity's gifts to the Father and offering God's gift to his people. In this sacred exchange the mystagogue initiates God's people into the very mystery of Being itself. By linking earth with heaven, the finite with the infinite, the mystagogue acts as the instrument of the Spirit who invites a recalibration of vision to see the whole world suffused with the divine presence; to see the Divine who, beguiled by his own goodness, comes to abide in all things.[4] In short, the mystagogue is habitually attentive to the presence of eternity within life's transience; he is attentive to what St. Augustine describes as *totum esse praesens*.[5] The mystagogue draws others into this speculative, contemplative gaze of eternity. In this sense, Fr. Matthew Lamb is a mystagogue. His *Lebenswerk* as a theologian is to invite others to see the interplay of eternity and time; to contemplate the God who at once utterly transcends the diastemic character of time and yet draws time and its manifold goods into his eternal embrace. As a student under Fr. Lamb, I remember well how he would reiterate that our animating Christian hope remains God's eternity, in which nothing is lost, but all is perfected: the immense aspirations and efforts of countless human beings in acquiring skills, developing intellectual and moral virtues—the wisdom of Socrates, Plato, Aristotle—all these noble and godlike achievements are

3. LSJ.

4. Cf. Dionysius the *Areopagite*: "And, in truth, it must be said too that the very cause of the universe in the beautiful, good superabundance of his benign yearning for all is also carried outside of himself in the loving care he has for everything. He is, as it were, beguiled by his goodness, by love, and by yearning and is enticed away from the transcendent dwelling place and comes to abide within all things, and he does so by virtue of his supernatural and ecstatic capacity to remain, nevertheless, within himself." Dionysius, *On the Divine Names,* 4.13.

5. *Conf.* 11.11.13: "In the eternal, nothing is transient, but the whole is present" (*totum esse praesens*). I have used the translation by Chadwick and the *CCSL* Latin text.

not destined to end in death and obliteration. The eternal is no apersonal permanence; the eternal is inter-personal presence.[6]

Fr. Lamb recognizes in Augustine's striking exposition of eternity as *totum esse praesens* a uniquely Christian—indeed, a hope-filled—understanding of time and eternity. If the mystagogue draws his *discipuli* into the contemplation of eternal being and its temporal implications, then Fr. Lamb is truly a mystagogue.

In this essay, I will argue that in the riveting scene of mystical ecstasy at Ostia in *Confessions* 9.10.23–26, Augustine presents his mother, Monica, as a mystagogue, who draws in Augustine to share her contemplative gaze of eternity, so that Augustine comes to understand eternity as *totum esse praesens*. The mystical experience at Ostia, in which Augustine recounts, "[o]ur minds were lifted up by ardent affection towards eternal being itself," is an experience of ascent not unique to Book 9 of the *Confessions*. But the fact that Monica is present is unique. What is the significance of her participation in the experience at Ostia? This question becomes more acute when placed in the context of Augustine's previous attempt at ascent in *Confessions* VII, where his mother is notably absent. Monica's presence at Ostia becomes significant when we consider how she is depicted in the only other works where she features prominently, namely, the Cassiciacum dialogues (particularly, *De beata vita* and *De ordine*). As such, we will first consider how Monica is portrayed in the Dialogues, namely, as a true philosopher in possession of eternal wisdom to which she guides her disciples. Second, we will examine how this portrait finds completion at Ostia, in which, at the end of Monica's life, she is united with her son in an experience of the eternity to which her philosophy was consistently ordered.

MONICA AT CASSICIACUM

The dialogues anticipate the presentation of Monica as the *mulier sapiens* at Ostia. Here at Cassiciacum she is the woman endowed with a particular (divine) gift of wisdom, guiding those under her tutelage to eternal wisdom.[7] In the dialogues it is reiterated that Monica does not speak

6. Lamb, *Eternity, Time, and the Life of Wisdom*, 52.

7. O'Donnell points to "parallels in antiquity" for Monica's presence in Augustine's writings, especially in Plato's Diotima in the *Symposium*. Cf. O'Donnell, *Confessions*, 123. Cf. O'Farrell, "Monica, the Mother of Augustine," 23–43; Cacciavillani, *Mamma fino a diventare santa*; Lamirande, "Quand Monique," 3–19; Djuth, "Augustine, Monica, and the Love of Wisdom," 237–52.

with an authority derived from an extensive education in the liberal arts, but from an authority grounded in faith, hope, and love whereby she leads, guides, and nurtures her "children" into eternal Wisdom. Her mystagogical vocation finds its culmination at Ostia.

De beata vita is a dialogue that spans a three-day celebration in honor of Augustine's birthday. In each of the three days Monica interjects to offer a decisive contribution to the overarching question about what constitutes the happy life. In the introduction Augustine lists the contributors to the philosophical colloquy. In the first place, he writes, "our mother" (*nostra mater*) was present.[8] The first person plural not only suggests Monica's spiritual motherhood of all present, but also anticipates the ecclesial character she will represent. It is on her account, writes Augustine, that "I owe everything that I live."[9] Augustine inquires whether one who possesses what he wants is happy. Monica answers, "If he wishes and possesses good things, he is happy; if he desires evil things—no matter if he possesses them—he is wretched."[10] At this point Augustine is elated; he smiles and remarks gladly, "Mother, you have really gained the mastery of the very stronghold of philosophy" (*arcem philosophiae*).[11] Augustine continues by saying that his mother has given a definition of philosophy consonant with that offered by Cicero in the *Hortensius*. She has explained that happiness consists not in living according to the dictates of the will, but, rather, according to a will that is rightly ordered. On this account, evil is not the failure to attain what we desire, but consists, rather, in disordered desires. Philosophy is principally concerned with achieving the happy life and, therefore, after taking note of Monica's exposition of *vera philosophia* as rightly ordered love, Augustine remarks, "At these words our mother exclaimed in such a way that we, entirely forgetting her sex, thought we had some great man in our midst, while in the meantime I became fully aware whence and from what divine source this flowed" (*diuino fonte manarent*).[12]

8. *beata u.* 1.6 (CCSL 29:68).

9. Ibid.: *in primis nostra mater, cuius meriti credo esse omne, quod uiuo*.

10. Ibid., 2.10 (CCSL 29:70): *Si bona, inquit, uelit et habeat, beatus est, si autem mala uelit, quamuis habeat, miser est.*

11. Ibid.: *ipsam, inquam, prorsus, mater, arcem philosophiae tenuisti.*

12. Ibid.: *In quibus uerbis illa sic exclamabat, ut obliti penitus sexus eius magnum aliquem uirum considere nobis cum crederemus me interim, quantum poteram, intellegente, ex quo illa et quam diuino fonte manarent*.

Although uneducated in the philosophical tradition, Monica offers an account of wisdom comparable to that of Cicero. An infused gift from a "divine source" (*diuino fonte*) allows her to speak as "a great man" (*magnum uirum*). The conversation is steered toward a consideration of what might be a fitting object of rightly ordered love. The nature of happiness entails that our desires not rest in any finite good. After all, the possession of many temporal goods is fraught with the fear of losing them. Again, Monica makes the decisive contribution: happiness, she explains, lies not in the possession of things, but in the moderation of mind.[13] Augustine is, once again, exuberant in his response: "'Very well expressed,' I said. 'No better answer to my question could be expected, and no other one from you.'"[14] Monica has led the colloquy to the conclusion that the appropriate object of love must be "eternal and remaining" (*aeternus et semper manens*), and the conclusion follows that "whoever possess God is happy."[15]

Even a person who has an abundance of temporal possessions but nonetheless lacks eternal wisdom should be considered in want and miserable, remarks Monica.[16] All were amazed and admired Monica's assertion; Augustine himself remarks, "I myself was filled with joy and delight because it was she who had uttered that truth which, as gleaned from the books of the philosophers, I had intended to bring forward as an imposing final argument."[17] Monica's contributions consistently sublimate temporal good to eternal good; happiness consists above all in possessing eternal wisdom. Monica had obtained this wisdom, not "from the books of the philosophers" but as an infused gift from God. This is abundantly clear in the closing scene of *De beata vita*. Monica, brimming with faith and joy, prays the hymn she received from St. Ambrose: *foue precantes, trinitas*.[18] Then she concludes, "Indeed, this is undoubtedly the happy life, that is, the perfect life, which we must assume that we can attain soon

13. Ibid., 2.11 (CCSL 29:72): *animi sui moderatione beatus est*.

14. Ibid.: *Optime, inquam, nec huic interrogationi aliud nec abs te aliud debuit responderi.*

15. Ibid.: *Deum igitur, inquam, qui habet, beatus est.*

16. Ibid., 4.27 (CCSL 29:80).

17. Ibid.: *Ubi cum omnes mirando exclamassent me ipso etiam non mediocriter alacri atque laeto, quod ab ea potissimum dictum esset, quod pro magno de philosophorum libris atque ultimum proferre paraueram.*

18. Ibid., 4.35 (CCSL 29:85).

by a well-founded faith, a joyful hope and an ardent love."[19] Monica receives *vera philosophia* as an infused and unmediated gift of the theological virtues directly from the Triune God to whom she has prayed.[20] The theological virtues are ordered to eternity, and this gift allows her to be the mystagogue for the gathered community at Cassiciacum; it is *she* who offers the decisive contribution to the quest for happiness that animates *De beata vita*, namely, that he who possesses eternal wisdom is happy.

The distinct (divine) source of Monica's wisdom comes to the fore again in *De ordine*. This dialogue was penned in the year of Augustine's conversion (386) and deals with the problem of theodicy in light of divine providence. *De ordine* reveals Augustine's early confidence that creation is intelligible and offers a *via* of ascent to the Creator through the study of the seven liberal arts. Augustine's mother comes into the dialogue at the conclusion of the first book. Augustine wants to record her name and contributions for the records. However, Monica objects: it is uncustomary for a woman to be included in a philosophical dialogue. But Augustine insists. He maintains that only proud men who are more concerned with external appearances than with truth would deem it unseemly to have a woman in their dialogues. Besides, Augustine continues, one finds precedent in the writings of ancient philosophers for the appearance of the most surprising characters, including shoemakers and women.[21] This initial exchange regarding Monica's place in the philosophical records is intended to draw attention to a salient theme in the dialogue, namely, Augustine's insistence that his mother, Monica, is a true philosopher, despite the fact that her wisdom issues from a different source than classical philosophy. Augustine tells Monica, "[Y]our philosophy is very pleasing to me,"[22] and so, she acquiesces and allows her name to be recorded in the philosophical records.

Augustine goes on to explain to his mother that the etymological definition of *philosophia* is "love of wisdom." Paul's prohibition against vain philosophy (Col 2:8)[23] is a warning against the philosophy of this world. Augustine writes, "But there is another world utterly remote from these eyes of ours, a world which the intellect of a few sound men

19. Ibid.: *haec est nullo ambigente beata uita, quae uita perfecta est, ad quam nos festinantes posse perduci solida fide alacri spe flagranti caritate praesumendum est*.

20. Cf. Djuth, "Augustine, Monica, and the Love of Wisdom," 244.

21. Cf. *ord*. 1.11.31 (CCSL 29:105).

22. Ibid.: *et philosophia tua mihi plurimum placet*.

23. All citations from the Bible in this chapter are from the RSV.

beholds."[24] Love of wisdom is the love of this other world. After all, notes Augustine, Christ did not say, "My kingdom is not of the world," but "My kingdom is not of *this* world."[25] *Vera philosophia* is not the knowledge of the *saeculum*, but the love of eternal wisdom. It is this love that Monica has already cultivated. Indeed, so much so, that Augustine remarks, "[Y]ou love it even more than you love me."[26] Monica no longer fears any of life's perturbations; the prospect of her own death and even that of her son does not trouble her. Augustine tells Monica, "[Y]ou are not frightened by the dread of any chance discomfort or even death itself."[27]

A mainstay of the Platonic philosophical synthesis is that *the* definitive mark of the true philosopher is that he no longer fears death.[28] Augustine notes that even for the greatest philosophers this state is achieved with immense difficulty, and yet, Monica, who does not even know the etymology of the word *philosophia*, has achieved this "greatest stronghold of philosophy" (*summam philosophiae arcem*).[29] Just as in *De beata vita*, Augustine here also uses this phrase—*philosophiae arcem*—to bespeak the height of Monica's philosophical achievement. Both in *De beata vita* and in *De ordine* it is her confidence that happiness does not reside in this world, in what our eyes can see, but is, rather, the possession of eternal wisdom, that marks her off as the true philosopher. Significantly, Augustine concludes the exchange with his mother by recognizing her as a mystagogue and himself as her *discipulus*: "[S]hall I not gladly entrust myself to you even as a disciple?"[30]

After a few days Augustine reconvenes the group at Cassiciacum. Monica is present from the outset of the second book of *De ordine*.

24. Ibid.: *Esse autem alium mundum ab istis oculis remotissimum, quem paucorum sanorum intellectus intuetur*.

25. Ibid.: *satis ipse Christus significat, qui non dicit: 'regnum meum non est de mundo', sed:* regnum meum non est de hoc mondo.

26. Ibid.: *Nunc uero cum eam multo plus quam me ipsum diligas*.

27. Ibid.: *cum que in ea tantum profeceris, ut iam nec cuiusuis incommodi fortuiti nec ipsius mortis, quod uiris doctissimis difficillimum est, horrore terrearis*.

28. Djuth writes, "True philosophers, by contrast, search for the truth for its own sake and are not afraid of death because they know that wisdom is eternal and cannot be found in the temporal world." See "Augustine, Monica, and the Love of Wisdom," 240. How love of eternal wisdom overcomes the fear of death in the Platonic tradition is considered by Malingrey, *"Philosophia,"* 104–6; and Courcelle, "Verissima philosophia," 655nn14–15.

29. *ord.* 1.11.32 (CCSL 29:106).

30. Ibid.: *ego ne me non libenter tibi etiam discipulum dabo?*

Indeed, Augustine insists on her presence because of Monica's "burning desire for things divine [and because] . . . her mind had been revealed to me as so rare that nothing seemed more adapted for true philosophy" (*uerae philosophiae*).[31] The colloquy has arrived at the knotty issue of divine providence in the face of evil. Monica asserts, "I think that nothing could have been done aside from the order of God, because evil itself, what has had an origin, in no way originated by the order of God; but that divine justice permitted it not to be beyond the limits of order, and has brought it back and confined it to an order befitting it."[32] Monica enters into the philosophical challenge of theodicy by distinguishing between the good order created by God and the evil that God permits. Monica's consistent contribution is to distinguish between the (ordered) eternity of God and the (disordered) finitude of post-lapsarian created existence; it is this sustained advertence to the order of eternity that marks her off as a true philosopher.

Near the conclusion to *De ordine* Augustine considers how one can begin to understand immaterial and eternal being, that is to say, how might one ascend from "images" to being itself.[33] First, such knowledge cannot be achieved by one "still a slave to his passions" or "desirous of perishable goods."[34] Next, one needs to study immaterial concepts such as intelligible numbers. This requires both "good talents" and "leisure" to follow the "order of study."[35] The goal of the ascent in the liberal arts, Augustine continues, is to foster precisely such ability, not only to excel in practical skills, but also "for the knowledge and contemplation of things."[36] Augustine freely admits that the attainment of such knowledge

31. Ibid., 2.1.1 (CCSL 29:106): *Nobiscum erat etiam mater nostra, cuius ingenium atque in res diuinas inflammatum animum cum antea conuictu diuturno et diligenti consideratione perspexeram tum uero in quadam disputatione non paruae rei, quam die natali meo cum conuiuis habui atque in libellum contuli, tanta mihi mens eius apparuerat, ut nihil aptius uerae philosophiae uideretur*.

32. Ibid., 2.7.23 (CCSL 29:120): *Tum mater: Ego, inquit, non puto nihil potuisse praeter dei ordinem fieri, quia ipsum malum, quod natum est, nullo modo dei ordine natum est, sed illa iustitia id inordinatum esse non siuit et in sibi meritum ordinem redegit et conpulit*.

33. Ibid., 2.16.44 (CCSL 29:131). The motif of ascent from images to being itself in Augustine's early thought is explored in greater detail in Boersma, *The Origins of Augustine's Early Theology of Image*.

34. Ibid.

35. Ibid.

36. Ibid., 2.5.16. For discussion of Augustine's understanding of the ascent *via* the liberal arts in *De ordine*, see Kenney, *Contemplation and Classical Christianity*, 65–74.

is extremely challenging. Then, he turns to his mother. He encourages her not to be alarmed at the difficulty of the rugged ascent to things eternal by way of the liberal arts: "For many persons, to be sure, they are difficult to learn. But for you, whose talents are brought home to me anew every day—and I know your mind, far removed from all frivolity, both by reason of your age and because of your remarkable moderation, and now rising above the abject misery of the body, has already risen to great heights within itself—for you, those matters will be as easy as they are difficult for duller souls who live most wretchedly."[37] Monica's ascent to things eternal will prove a success more on account of her internal disposition of moderation (which is the hallmark of the virtuous soul) than on account of her learning. Again, we are presented with Monica's *vera philosophia*, which is the sublimation of temporal goods to eternal good, as she rises above the "miseries of the body." In her initial foray in the dialogue she earns a place in the records even when prideful philosophers concerned only with appearances would sanction her presence. Here too, Augustine notes that those well trained in the liberal arts would quibble about the pronunciation of this or that word and that Monica might stumble on this score.[38] However, this lack of training does not impair her ascent. She deserves a place at the philosophical table because she has grasped the end goal of philosophy, namely, love of eternal wisdom. Despite her lack of formation in liberal arts such as grammar, Augustine tells her, "[You] grasp the almost heavenly power and nature of grammar, and with so much discernment that you seem to have taken hold of its very soul, and to have left its body for the eloquent."[39] Perhaps, with training, some ascend in the liberal arts from correct grammar to the articulation of wisdom, but Monica, suggests Augustine, knows with a direct and internal élan the true kernel of eternal wisdom apart from the husk of ornate language within which it might be cloaked. One could

37. *ord.* 2.17.45 (CCSL 29:131): *cognitione autem multis quidem ardua, tibi tamen, cuius ingenium cotidie mihi nouum est et cuius animum uel aetate uel admirabili temperantia remotissimum ab omnibus nugis et a magna labe corporis emergentem in se multum surrexisse cognosco, tam erunt facilia quam difficilia tardissimis miserrime que uiuentibus.*

38. Cf. Ibid.

39. Ibid.: *Sed tu contemptis istis uel puerilibus rebus uel ad te non pertinentibus ita grammaticae paene diuinam uim naturam que cognosces, ut eius animam tenuisse, corpus disertis reliquisse uidearis.*

say that faith as a form of knowledge allows Monica to short-circuit the ascent laboriously achieved by the few through the liberal arts.[40]

The concluding prayer in the final chapter of *De ordine* points to Augustine's mother as a guide whom the philosophic community at Cassiciacum ought to follow. They are to pray for "a life most virtuous," and ask that they may see not a part of reality, as one does in this world of sense, but may come, instead, to see the whole. This is seen "in the intelligible world, [where] every part is as beautiful and perfect as the whole."[41] They are to pray not for temporal goods ("wealth or honors or any fleeting and changeful things . . . that quickly pass away"), but instead for those things that will make them "virtuous and happy."[42] Then Augustine states, "And, mother, to the end that these petitions be most observantly made, we enjoin the charge on you, through whose prayers I unhesitatingly believe and proclaim that God has given me this resolve: to prize nothing more highly than the finding of truth, to wish for, to think of, to love nothing else. And I furthermore believe that through your petitioning we shall obtain the great blessing which through your meriting we have come to desire."[43] Monica has guided and nurtured Augustine's love of things eternal; she has led him to desire the end of philosophy. Her prayers and witness have cultivated his participation in eternal wisdom.

MONICA AT OSTIA

Now that we have sketched the mystagogical persona of Monica at Cassiciacum, her significance at Ostia becomes more conspicuous. There Augustine and Monica face death unafraid; in fact, they are filled with hope as they touch eternal wisdom itself. In the Dialogues Monica teaches

40. Djuth has made a similar claim: "Monica's lack of extensive training in the liberal arts hardly impairs her ability to grasp the fundamental truths of Christianity. If anything, her grasp of these truths is more vital than the abstract knowledge of the academician because her understanding of them has its roots in faith, hope, and charity." "Augustine, Monica and the Love of Wisdom," 246.

41. *ord*. 2.19.51 (CCSL 29:135): *in illo uero mundo intellegibili quamlibet partem tamquam totum pulchram esse atque perfectam*.

42. Ibid., 2.20.52 (CCSL 29:135): *quae nos bonos faciant ac beatos*.

43. Ibid.: *Quae uota ut deuotissime inpleantur, tibi maxime hoc negotium, mater, iniungimus, cuius precibus indubitanter credo atque confirmo mihi istam mentem deum dedisse, ut inueniendae ueritati nihil omnino praeponam, nihil aliud uelim, nihil cogitem, nihil amem, nec desino credere nos hoc tantum bonum, quod te promerente concupiuimus, eadem te petente adepturos.*

Augustine and his friends *vera philosophia*, which is that true happiness consists in the possession of eternal wisdom. Augustine entrusts himself to his mother as a *discipulus*, recognizing that her wisdom is not derived from the study of the liberal arts, but from participation in the "divine source" of Wisdom, from which she receives the infused theological virtues. Monica shows herself to be a true philosopher who, because she has reached the "greatest stronghold of philosophy" (*philosophiae arcem*), no longer fears death. All this finds its culmination at Ostia.[44]

In some sense the ascent in *Conf.* 9.10 is strikingly similar to that in Book 8 of the *Confessions*. In both cases Augustine recounts an ascent of the soul to a mystical, ecstatic experience of eternity. Indeed, much of the phraseology in the two passages is nearly identical with a Plotinian cadence suffusing both passages. Significantly, both texts share the conclusion that eternity is not grasped in this life. Nevertheless, the presence of Monica at Ostia establishes a drastically different spiritual tenor. The Ostian narrative is charged with optimism: Monica leads her son to the awareness that time and its passing do not stand in opposition to eternity. Nor is the effervescence of time to be eventually lost in an anonymous sea of eternal nothingness. Rather, as Fr. Lamb so often reminds his students, time is created by God the Eternal, so that finite being is anchored in eternal being. God's eternal truth and wisdom do not negate contingent reality; rather, a participatory ontology grounds and redeems contingent reality.[45] It is precisely this theological reality that allows Monica and Augustine—finite and contingent as they are—to experience a hope-filled ascent to eternal wisdom that is not present to the same degree in *Conf.* 7.[46]

44. My attempt to read the significance of Monica's presence at Ostia in light of how she is presented in the Dialogues builds on the work of Marianne Djuth who maintains, "Augustine's portrait of Monica in the Cassiciacum dialogues and the *Confessions*, then, is a crucial link in understanding what he means by the *vera philosophia* of Christianity." "Augustine, Monica, and the Love of Wisdom," 238. The connection between the stylized portrait of Monica derived from the Dialogues and her presence at Ostia has also been noted by Coyle: "[T]he motive behind the Ostia account is—in part at least—to direct attention to Monica as a true philosopher who has reached the furthest heights to which one can be brought in this life by a philosophy which is true." "In Praise of Monica," 90.

45. Lamb writes, "The spiritual nature of intelligence together with the *Veritas* of true judgment is the ground for understanding God as the Eternal, creating and redeeming the temporal. The transcendence by truth of space and time does not negate space and time, but affirms them." "Temporality and History," 826.

46. Hope is what makes Monica's impending death so much different from that of

The attempt to delineate precise (Plotinian) parallels between the ascents at Milan and Ostia are numerous.[47] Earlier twentieth-century studies of these two experiences in the *Confessions* tended to focus on the shared Neoplatonic language operative in the two narratives and from this premise assert that the experiences at Milan and Ostia are substantially identical. In this vein André Mandouze succinctly remarks, "C'est qu'il n'y a aucune différence de nature entre les deux expériences."[48] James O'Donnell is correct, in my opinion, to dismiss such superficial structural analyses as "hopelessly wrongheaded."[49] Similarities of structure and even of (Platonic) language serve only to accent the *qualitative* difference between Milan and Ostia: at Ostia, with Monica, Augustine has a *Christian* experience.[50] The intervening period between the ascent in Books VII and IX of the *Confessions* entail considerable change. In those sixteen months Augustine has had a heart-rending experience in the Milanese Garden, through which he was converted to the Christian faith and subsequently baptized. The moral regeneration and participation in the sacramental life of the church means that (according to Augustine's theology) the ascents in Milan and Ostia *cannot* find substantially the same theological expression. The faith that Augustine now shares with Monica infuses a deep and abiding eschatological *hope* to the ascent narrative of *Conf.* 9.10. I

Socrates. As Fr. Lamb notes, "The philosophical agnosticism stated by Socrates at the end of the *Apology*: —I go to die, you to live; but which of us goes to a better reality is unknown to all but God"—was no match for the disorder and evil of human history and of Augustine's own wayward living. In the covenant with Israel and the new covenant in Jesus Christ, God has made known to us how death and evil are overcome." "Temporality and History," 821.

47. The most significant studies that advance this analysis are Mandouze, *Saint Augustin*, 685–99; Courcelle, *Recherches sur les Confessions*, 222–24; O'Connell, *Images of Conversion.*

48. Mandouze, *Saint Augustin*, 697. Likewise, Burnaby writes, "There is no ground for the claim that the intervening 'purgation' and reception into the Church gave to the so-called ecstasy at Ostia a 'Christian' quality lacking to the earlier experience . . . Before and after Christian baptism, the method of a pagan philosopher brought to Augustine a moment's immediate sense of the living and changeless God." *Amor Dei*, 32. Henry's influential study, *La Vision d'Ostie*, argues to the same effect: the similarities of Plotinian idiom entail that both books 7 and 9 of the *Confessions* relate a Platonic experience of the vision of God.

49. O'Donnell, *Augustine,* 124.

50. O'Donnell notes that despite "*all the structural parallels*, the substance of the event was different for its Christianization; indeed, the parallels have the effect of calling attention to the differences." O'Donnell, *Augustine, 124.*

am arguing that this hope, to which Monica leads Augustine, sets the Ostian narrative apart from that of Milan. While both ascents are fleeting experiences, that of Ostia is described as a foretaste of heaven, to which they remain bound (*religatas*) in hope even after the conclusion of the experience. In contrast, after the experience in Milan Augustine crashes down, back into the *regio dissimilitudinis*; at Ostia Augustine and Monica experience the *regio ubertatis indeficientis*: the "region of inexhaustible abundance where you feed Israel eternally with truth for food."[51] After this experience they retain the "first fruits of the Spirit."

Along with other significant events in the *Confessions*, the experience at Ostia takes place in a garden (*hortus*). Augustine and his mother are leaning out of a window at a house in Ostia, the port city of Rome where the Tiber flows into the Mediterranean Sea. The context that Augustine establishes in *Conf.* 9.10.23 is significant. Augustine and Monica were alone (*soli*), removed from the crowd (*remoti a turbis*) after an exhausting journey and were in the process of regaining their strength.[52] Their mystical ascent occurs in the context of an intimate conversation (*conloquebamur*) about the nature of eternity: "We asked what quality of life the eternal life of the saints will have."[53] The presence of Monica—who at this point of the *Confessions* is established as an ecclesial symbol, as in *De beata vita*—is the first clear demarcation between this ascent and that in Book VII. Augustine's ascent in *Conf.* 7 follows Plotinus's injunction to ascend alone to the Alone.[54] Here a communal élan replaces the solitary flight to the One. The ecclesial context of the ascent, represented by Monica's presence, is reinforced in the discussion regarding the nature of the eternal life of the saints. ("We asked what quality of life the eternal life of the saints will have."[55]) As such, the substance of their mystical experience is proleptically present already in their conversation: eternal

51. *Conf.* 9.10.24 (CCSL 27:147): *ut attingeremus regionem ubertatis indeficientis, unde pascis Israel in aeternum veritate pabulo*.

52. In many ways this scene is the realization of what Augustine and his friends had proposed years earlier in *Conf.* 6.14.24 (CCSL 27:89–90): a communal life devoted to contemplation. The plan, over which Augustine and his friends then conversed (*conloquentes*), was to withdraw from the crowds and storms of human life (*turbulentas humanae vitae*) and to have all things in common while living a life of contemplation. Cf. O'Donnell, *Augustine, 125*.

53. *Conf.* 9.10.23 (CCSL 27:147): *qualis futura esset vita aeterna sanctorum.*

54. Ibid., 7.10.16: "By the Platonic books I was admonished to return into myself."

55. Ibid., 9.10.23 (CCSL 27:147).

life is the communion of the whole temporal, created order redeemed and delighting in God's eternity.[56]

The conversation proceeds to contrast bodily delights with spiritual delights. This was, of course, the heart of Monica's teaching about happiness at Cassiciacum and that which marked her off as a true philosopher: "[T]he pleasure of the bodily senses, however delightful in the radiant light of this physical world, is seen by comparison with the life of eternity to be not even worth considering."[57] At this point Augustine recounts, "Our minds were lifted up by an ardent affection towards eternal being itself (*idipsum*)."[58] In *Conf.* 7 Augustine twice describes catching sight, in a "trembling glance," of that "which is" (*ad id quod est*); similarly, here, too, being itself (*idipsum*) is experienced.[59] Much

56. Louth notes that in contrast to the solitary nature of a Plotinian ascent, here at Ostia we see the heartbeat of Augustine's ecclesial and eschatological vision, which is social: "This makes one wonder to what extent friendship, companionship, communion with other human beings, is important for Augustine in his ascent to God . . . [T]here is a strand—and an important strand—in Augustine's thought that stresses the social nature of final beatitude." *The Origins of the Christian Mystical Tradition*, 136.

57. *Conf.* 9.10.24 (CCSL 27:147): *ut carnalium sensuum delectatio quantalibet, in quantalibet luce corporea, prae illius vitae iucunditate non conparatione, sed ne commemoratione quidem digna videretur.*

58. *Conf.* 9.10.24 (CCSL 27:147): *erigentes nos ardentiore affectu in idipsum.*

59. In Ibid., 7.10.16 (CCSL 27:103–4) and ibid., 7.17.23 (CCSL 27:107). Augustine ascends to an experience of eternal being. What he comes to realize in these experiences is the difference between time and eternity. It is helpful briefly to sketch both passages. In *Conf.* 7.10.16 Augustine recalls, "By the Platonic books I was admonished to return into myself." Ibid., 7.10.16. The turn within is the first step of the ascent for Plotinus. Finding eternal beauty does not involve the external trappings of flight, but involves turning to something already present to everyone. Plotinus admonishes, "Go back into yourself and look." Plotinus, *Enneads* 1.6.9. So this is precisely what Augustine does. He enters into his most intimate self (*intima mea*). Then, with his soul's eye (*oculo animae*) he sees the radiance of an unchanging light. Augustine emphasizes that this light was a mystical light; it was unlike any material or even intellectual light. In fact, it was this light that created him (*ipsa fecit me*). In this mystical experience Augustine comes to realize the real distinction between participating being and participated being; between the being that creates and the being of the creatures created ([*N*]*ec ita erat supra mentem meam . . . sed superior, quia ipsa fecit me, et ego inferior, quia factus ab ea*). In short, Augustine comes to grapple with the concept of eternity. He who knows this light, exclaims Augustine, knows eternity (*nouit aeternitatem*), but it is known only in love. This mystical experience causes Augustine to cry out, "O eternal truth and true love and beloved eternity! You are my God, to you I sigh day and night" (*O aeterna ueritas et uera caritas et cara aeternitas! tu es deus meus, tibi suspiro die ac nocte*). This word sigh (*suspiro*) is significant and will appear again when Augustine recounts his mystical experience at Ostia. The ecstasy described in *Conf.* 7.10.16 is

as in *Conf.* 7, created being and eternal being are contrasted: "Step by step we climbed beyond all corporeal objects and the heaven itself."[60] As in *Conf.* 7, the ascent is initiated by a turn within (*ascendebamus interius*). Monica and Augustine reflect and dialogue as they enter into their own minds (*venimus in mentes nostras*). Then, they ascend even beyond their own mind (*transcendimus eas*). In this way also the ascent at Ostia tracks that of Book VII.

One line, however, gives a decidedly different hue to the Ostian narrative: "We moved up beyond [our minds] so as to attain to the region of inexhaustible abundance where you feed Israel eternally with truth for food."[61] This arresting line captures precisely the qualitative difference be-

---

short lived. Augustine crashes down, unable to sustain the vision of eternal being. He finds himself far from eternity "in the region of dissimilarity" (*regio dissimilitudinis*). It is important, however, to underscore what precisely Augustine came to understand in this experience, namely, the real distinction between temporal being and eternal being: "What I saw is Being, and that I who saw am not yet Being" (*tu adsumpsisti me ut viderem esse quod viderem, et nondum me esse qui viderem*). Ibid., 7.10.16. In his retrospection of this initial ascent in book 7, Augustine writes, "And I considered the other things below you, and I saw that neither can they be said absolutely to be or absolutely not to be. They are because they come from you. But they are not because they are not what you are." Ibid., 7.11.17 (CCSL 27:104).

In many ways the second ascent described in *Confessions* 7 mirrors the first. In fact, many commentators suggest that it is one experience related in two ways. The ascent is initiated with Augustine contemplating the human phenomenon of judgment. Ibid., 7.17.23 (CCSL 27:107). The mind judges that mutable things *ought* to be this way or that way; this suggests an eternal principle upon which the mind bases such judgments. Augustine comes to an awareness that the "eternity of truth" used as the standard of truth is higher even than the mind which judges. He writes, "And so step by step I ascended from bodies to the soul which perceives through the body, and from there to its inward force . . . From there again I ascended to the power of reasoning to which is to be the attribute the power of judging the deliverances of the bodily senses." Ibid. This reasoning and judging power, Augustine discovers, is itself flooded by light. The ascent from the corporeal body to the incorporeal soul that renders judgment on bodily senses by its participation in eternal light leads Augustine to the same conclusion that he came to in the first description of his mystical experience in book 7: "At that point it had no hesitation in declaring that the unchangeable is preferable to the changeable . . . So in the flash of a trembling glance it attained to that which is (*ad id quod est*)." Ibid. Again, Augustine catches sight of being itself. But again he crashes down: "I did not possess the strength to keep my vision fixed. My weakness reasserted itself and I returned to my customary condition." Ibid.

60. Ibid., 9.10.24 (CCSL 27:147): *perambulavimus gradatim cuncta corporalia, et ipsum caelum.*

61. Ibid.: *ut attingeremus regionem ubertatis indeficientis, unde pascis Israel in aeternum veritate pabulo.*

tween the ascent at Ostia and the ascent in Book VII. In Milan Augustine could not sustain the vision of eternal being, as he soon found himself in the "region of dissimilarity" (*regione dissimilitudinis*); now, however, he finds himself in the "region of inexhaustible abundance" (*regionem ubertatis indeficientis*). It is certainly the case that the similarities between the two accounts are pronounced: both ascents lead to an experience of eternal reality resulting in a profound awareness of the difference between temporal being eternal being. Nevertheless, after the experience at Ostia, Monica and Augustine remain "bound to that higher world."[62] It is the *hope* of remaining bound (*religatas*) to eternity, which Monica the philosopher consistently taught is the highest good, that underwrites the rest and joy of the Ostian ascent and ensures its qualitative distinction from that in *Conf.* 7.

The previous ascent in Book 7 left Augustine disappointed. His "sigh" represents a lack of satisfied desire and a sense of incomplete and unsustained participation with the eternal being experienced.[63] Here, at Ostia, the "sigh" (*suspiravimus*) that Augustine and Monica share is different. They are talking and panting after eternal wisdom and then, in an enraptured moment of pure spiritual contemplation (*toto ictu cordis*), they touch it (*attingimus*).[64] Augustine then writes, "And we sighed and left behind us 'the firstfruits of the Spirit'[65] bound to that higher world."[66] This sighing bespeaks a different sentiment from the disappointed sigh in Book 7. This sighing is the sighing of satisfaction; Monica and Augustine have touched eternity. But eternity is not now gone. Rather, Augustine makes clear that his conversion and Monica's tutelage have led him beyond the insights of *Conf.* 7 to understand all time to be created,

62. Ibid.: *reliquimus ibi religatas primitias spiritus.*

63. Usually *suspirare* suggests an unfilled and incomplete desire. Cf. O'Donnell, *Augustine*, 130–31; and Courcelle, *Recherches*, 124–25. It is in this sense that Augustine uses the verb in 6.5.8; 6.10.17; 7.10.16; 9.7.16; 9.10.24; and 9.10.25. Cf. O'Donnell, *Augustine*, 130.

64. Augustine presents this moment of ecstasy with the word *ictus* (a blow, strike, or smite). He uses *ictus* elsewhere either to describe a sudden blow or a mystical experience that feels like a sudden blow. Cf. *Conf.* 7.1.1; 7.17.23; 9.8.18. Louth writes, "[T]his ecstasy is sudden and fleeting, and draws out the whole force of the soul (*toto ictu cordis*) with, it would seem, a certain violence." Louth, *The Christian Mystical Tradition*, 137.

65. Rom 8:23.

66. *Conf.* 9.10.24: *attingimus eam modice toto ictu cordis; et suspirauimus et reliquimus ibi religatas primitias spiritus.*

sustained, and taken up by eternal wisdom. The mystic does not leave time behind in his ascent to eternity, but instead comes to realize that the ground of his own temporal being (and all other being) is anchored in eternity.[67] Here we can at last put our finger on the decisive speculative difference between Monica the mystagogue and Plotinus's mystic (and, therefore, on the qualitative difference between the ascent in Milan and that of Ostia). Fr. Lamb explains that for Plotinus, "the task of the true philosopher or mystic is to leave behind all the temporal for the super-intuition of the eternal."[68] What Monica leads Augustine to realize is that eternity does not do away with time, but is the condition of time. Precisely at the apogee of the ascent at Ostia Augustine recalls the material and temporal event in which God provided for the people of Israel. The significance of this historical event Augustine understands to be made intelligible in eternity: "We moved up . . . to the region of inexhaustible abundance where you feed Israel eternally with truth for food."[69] The

67. Lamb underscores the philosophical breakthrough that Augustine's exposition of time and eternity represents. The philosophical legacy that Augustine inherited envisioned the Absolute One either as radically transcendent from finite being (*à la* Plato and Plotinus) or as immanent in finite being in such a way as to insert an "eternal element" into the finite order (as in the *νόησις νοήσεως*). Lamb writes, "[T]he efforts of philosophers and theologians to understand the divine either made the divine into Absolute Idea, the transcendence of which is the separation from all finite being; or they made the divine into Absolute Intelligence that somehow informs the whole universe, immanent in all that is . . . Where Plato can contrast the eternal and the temporal to the point of opposing them, Aristotelian scholarship has been unable to determine if the master ever decisively differentiated the eternal and the temporal. This has been a philosophical dialectic ever since: transcendence without immanence or immanence with a very questionable transcendence." *Eternity, Time, and the Life of Wisdom*, 38.

68. Ibid., 39.

69. This revelation of eternity in time is part of the broader divine pedagogy of Scripture in which God gradually discloses himself. Lamb writes, "The pedagogy of the Jewish Scriptures reveals an ever-deepening understanding of God from the tribal through the liberating warrior and the protector of the nation to the mysteriously transcendent God of the prophets and the wisdom literature. The transcendent God is immanent in the messianic suffering of Israel." Ibid.

While the descriptions of ascent in *Conf.* 7 are anti-climactic, they also, like the ascent of Ostia, speak to the temporal, material dispensation within which eternity redeems time. After finding himself in the *regio dissimilitudinis*, Augustine hears a voice speaking to him with encouragement from on high: "I am the food of the fully grown; grow and you will feed on me. And you will not change me into you like the food your flesh eats, but you will be changed into me." *Conf.* 7.10.16. The unmistakable eucharistic overtones in this passage invite Augustine to see that although his ascent in "upward participation" to grasp eternity fails, eternity comes in a movement of "downward participation" to his temporal condition to fit him for eternity. This

eternity of wisdom is that in which "all creatures come into being, both things which were and which will be."[70] Past, present, and future beings find stable existence in eternal wisdom, which perdures beyond the ravages of time. This is the hope experienced at Ostia. After experiencing—"touching"—eternal wisdom, Monica and Augustine remain "bound to that higher world" (*reliquimus ibi religatas*) in hope, even while they descend back into the distended realm of time "where a sentence has both a beginning and an ending."[71] Hope promises that all time and the many beautiful, good, and true things we make, experience, know, and love in time are taken up into the eternity of God, which never grows old but "gives renewal to all things."[72]

Four significant Pauline quotations frame and explicate the experience at Ostia. All four texts speak to an eschatology of hope. First, the scene unfolds with a reference to Philippians 3. Monica and Augustine are talking intimately, "forgetting the past and reaching forward to what lies ahead (Phil 3:13)."[73] In the letter to the Philippians Paul celebrates the fact that he is "found in Christ" (Phil 3:9). All other fleeting things he counts as nothing compared to knowing Christ and the sure hope that he will be raised with Christ in glory (Phil 3:10). Monica and Augustine's

comports with the broader leitmotif of book 7, which contrasts self-assured Plotinian motifs of ascent, tinged as they are with pride, with the descent of grace given through the humility of the incarnation. In the second description of ascent (*Conf.* 7.17.23 [CCSL 27:107]), comfort is again offered after a short-lived experience; this time in the form of memory and desire for "that of which I had the aroma but which I had not yet the capacity to eat." In the retrospection of his ascent Augustine explains that only after he had embraced the God-man, Jesus Christ, could he "enjoy" God. Augustine's successful ascent is predicated on accepting the prior descent of Christ. The experience of Milan, therefore, leans forward to that of Ostia. Augustine writes, "The food which I was too weak to accept he mingled with flesh, in that 'The Word was made flesh' (John 1:14), so that our infant condition might come to suck milk from you wisdom by which you create all things. To possess my God, the humble Jesus, I was not yet humble enough. I did not know what his weakness was meant to teach." Ibid., 7.18.24 (CCSL 27:108). The humility of the incarnation is the *via* of ascent, and its acceptance requires Augustine to renounce his pride. The emphasis in *Conf.* 7 lies in the sacramental means whereby Christ comes into distended time to feed those who are by grace led to ascend to eternity.

70. Ibid., 9.10.24 (CCSL 27:147): *et ibi vita sapientia est, per quam fiunt omnia ista, et quae fuerunt et quae futura sunt.*

71. Ibid.: *remeavimus ad strepitum oris nostri, ubi verbum et incipitur et finitur.*

72. Ibid.: *in se permanenti sine vetustate atque innovanti omnia.*

73. Ibid.: *et praeterita obliviscentes in ea quae ante sunt extenti.* Cf. O'Daly, "Time as *Distentio*," 265–71.

ascent finds its impetus in Paul's admonition to the Philippians to "reach forward," straining ahead in hope, "for the prize of the upward call of God in Christ Jesus" (Phil 3:14). They take Paul's words as their own: "Our commonwealth is in heaven, and from it we await a Savior, the Lord Jesus Christ, who will change our lowly body to be like his glorious body" (Phil 3:20–21). Hope promises that nothing in time, including "our lowly bodies" are lost, but in eternity all is fulfilled.

The second Pauline quotation is in response to Augustine and Monica's question of what the "eternal life" of the saints is like. In answer, Augustine quotes Paul's epistle to the Corinthians: "Neither eye has seen nor ear has heard, nor has it entered into the heart of man (1 Cor 2:9)."[74] The context of Paul's discourse maps perfectly onto the vision experienced at Ostia. Paul is speaking of the "wisdom of God"—"a secret and hidden wisdom" (1 Cor 2:7). Augustine and Monica "touch" this "wisdom by which all creatures come into being,"[75] but they do not yet participate in it fully. It is a wisdom "prepared" by God "for those that love him" (1 Cor 2:9), known only in hope, the substance of which is reserved for the eschatological *parousia*.

Romans 8:23 is the third and axial Pauline quotation. It is situated at the culmination of the ascent: "And while we talked and panted after [eternal wisdom], we touched it in some small degree by a moment of total concentration of the heart. And we sighed and left behind us 'the first-fruits of the spirit' bound to that higher world."[76] In Romans 8 Paul is expressing the hope of future glory that will far surpass present suffering. Along with the rest of creation, maintains Paul, we now groan as "we wait for adoption as sons, the redemption of our bodies," but the "first fruits of the Spirit" have already been given as pledge, "for it is in hope we are saved" (Rom 8:24). We *are* (now, in time!) saved in hope. This hope entails that the stark antithesis between time and eternity that underwrites the Platonic tradition is unsustainable. The "bondage to decay" (Rom 8:21) is not (as it is for Plato) the definitive and final word about temporal existence. Rather, in the words of Jesuit poet, Gerard Manley Hopkins, creation is "never spent"; there always "lives the dearest freshness deep down things."[77] The human person, endowed

74. *Conf.* 9.10.23 (CCSL 27:147): *quam nec oculus vidit nec auris audivit nec in cor hominis ascendit.*

75. Ibid., 9.10.24 (CCSL 27:147): *et ibi vita sapientia est, per quam fiunt omnia ista.*

76. Ibid.

77. Hopkins, "God's Grandeur."

with beauty and grace of body as well as intellectual and moral glory, is uniquely made in and for eternity. Time and temporal existence will be "set free from its bondage to decay and obtain the glorious liberty of the children of God" (Rom 8:21). Augustine and Monica experience a pledge of this hope at Ostia.

The final Pauline quotation deployed to relate the Ostian experience expresses what their vision means in relation to eternal life: "And when is that to be? Surely it is when 'we all rise again, but are not all changed' (1 Cor 15:51)."[78] The quote is part of Paul's lengthy treatise on the resurrection of the body in 1 Corinthians 15 and here forms the capstone to the experience of Ostia, anchoring the entire ascent in hope. As with the other Pauline texts, it is not a hope that we see now. ("If for this life only we have hoped in Christ, we are of all men most to be pitied" [1 Cor 15:19]). The hope of the resurrected body remains a mystery beyond our ken (1 Cor 15:51), but hope promises that the mortal will put on immortality (1 Cor 15:54) and that nothing that has being will be annihilated; rather, death, the privation of being, will be swallowed up in victory (1 Cor 15:54).

Paul's theology of hope is the warp and woof on which Augustine weaves the Ostian narrative. Their conversation is initiated with a meditation on Philippians 3 and 1 Corinthians 2. The heart of the mystical ecstasy of Ostia is related through the prism of Paul's paean to the victory of hope in Romans 8. Finally, 1 Cor 15 offers Augustine the language to express that a sure hope remains, in this life, apophatic in character.

Monica is about to die. Her conversation with her son has been focused on eternity and the life of the saints with God. Earthly pleasures, she remarks, are "not even worth considering" with the joy of eternity.[79] Monica is presented as reaching a perfected mystical state. Her heart is set on things above. As in the Cassiciacum dialogues, Monica considers all temporal goods insignificant to "truth which is you yourself,"[80] "eternal being itself,"[81] and "eternal wisdom."[82] She has completed her life's mission: she has led Augustine to participate in eternal wisdom. Thinking back on their last conversation Augustine writes, "Yet, Lord,

78. *Conf.* 9.10.25 (CCSL 27:148): *et istud quando? an cum omnes resurgimus, sed non omnes inmutabimur?*

79. Ibid., 9.10.23.

80. Ibid.

81. Ibid., 9.10.24.

82. Ibid.

you know that on that day when we had this conversation . . . this world with all its delights became worthless to us."[83] Monica herself seals their experience, saying, "My son, as for myself, I now find no pleasure in this life . . . My hope in this world is already fulfilled."[84] It is important not to misprize this evaluation; the sustained theological emphasis on hope that underwrites the entire Ostian ascent, suggests that Monica's mystagogy does not devalue temporal existence, but hopes for its fulfillment in eternity. As Fr. Lamb writes so eloquently, "Eternity does not denigrate time, but creates time in order, through intelligent creatures, to invite a return. Augustine presents God as *totum esse praesens*, the fullness of Being as Presence freely creating, sustaining, and redeeming the universe and all of human history in the Triune Presence. All extensions and durations, all past, present, and future events, are present in the immutable and eternal understanding, knowing, and loving who are Father, Word, and Spirit."[85]

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Augustine. *De beata vita*. In *Corpus Christianorum Series Latina*, edited by W. M. Green and K. D. Daur, 29:63–85. Turnhout: Brepols, 1970.

———. *Confessions*. Translated by Henry Chadwick. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991.

———. *Confessionum libri tredecim*. Edited by Luc Verheijen. *Corpus Christianorum Series Latina* 27. Turnhout: Brepols, 1981.

———. *The Happy Life*. Translated by Ludwig Schopp. Writings of Augustine 1. Washington DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1948.

———. *De ordine libri duo*. In *Corpus Christianorum Series Latina*, edited by W. M. Green and K. D. Daur, 29:87–137. Turnhout: Brepols, 1970.

———. *On Order*. Translated by Robert Russell. Writings of Augustine 1. Washington DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1948.

Burnaby, John. *Amor Dei: A Study in the Religion of St. Augustine*. Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock, 2007.

Cacciavillani, Ivone. Mamma fino a diventare santa. La vicenda umana di Monica alla ricerca del figlio Agostino. Gregoriana: Padova, 1986.

Courcelle, Pierre. *Recherches sur les Confessions de saint Augustin*. Paris: Boccard, 1968.

———. "Verissima philosophia." In *Epektasis: Mélanges patristiques offerts au cardinal Jean Daniélieu*, edited by Jacques Fontaine and Charles Kannengiesser, 653–59. Paris: Beauchesne, 1972.

Coyle, Kevin. "In Praise of Monica." *Augustinian Studies* 13 (1982) 87–96.

Djuth, Marianne. "Augustine, Monica, and the Love of Wisdom." *Augustinian Studies* 39 (2008) 237–52.

83. Ibid., 9.10.26.

84. Ibid.: *iam consumpta spe huius saeculi*.

85. Lamb, *Eternity, Time, and the Life of Wisdom*, 41–42.

Henry, Paul. *La Vision d'Ostie*. Paris: Vrin, 1938.
Hopkins, Gerard Manley. "God's Grandeur." In *Gerard Manley Hopkins: The Major Works*, 128. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009.
Kenney, John Peter. *Contemplation and Classical Christianity*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013.
Lamb, Matthew. "Temporality and History: Reflections from St. Augustine and Bernard Lonergan." *Nova et Vetera* 4 (2006) 815–50.
———. *Eternity, Time, and the Life of Wisdom*. Naples, FL: Sapientia, 2007.
Lamirande, Emilien. "*Quand Monique,* la mere d'Augustin, prend la parole." In *Signum Pietatis, Festgabe für Cornelius Petrus Mayer OSA zum 60*, edited by Adolar Zumkeller, 3–19. Würzburg: Augustinus, 1989.
Liddell, Henry G., et al., eds. *A Greek-English Lexicon*. Oxford: Clarendon, 1996.
Louth, Andrew. *The Origins of the Christian Mystical Tradition*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.
Malingrey, Anne-Marie. *"Philosophia":* Étude d'un groupe de mots dans la littérature grecque*, des Présocratiques au IVe siècle après J.-C.* Études et commentaires 40. Paris: Klincksieck, 1961.
Mandouze, André. *Saint Augustin: L'Aventure de la raison et de la grâce*. Paris: Études augustiniennes, 1968.
O'Connell, Robert. *Images of Conversion in Augustine's Confessions*. New York: Fordham University Press, 1996.
O'Daly, Gerard. "Time as *Distentio* and St. Augustine's Exegesis of Philippians 3,12–14." *Revue d'Études Augustiniennes* 23 (1977) 265–71.
O'Donnell, James. *Confessions: Commentary on Books 8–13*. Oxford: Clarendon, 1992.
O'Farrell, M. M. "Monica, the Mother of Augustine: A Reconsideration." *Recherches Augustiniennes* 10 (1975) 23–43.